REBUTTAL ARGUMENT STATIONS PEER REVIEW

Author's Name: _____________________________ 
Peer Reviewer's Name: ________________________ ____

CONTENT CHECKERS

I. Does the thesis statement include the audience (writer of the original essay), his or her claim, and your classmate’s refutation or counter-argument? Label them above the thesis on the essay.

II. Does the introduction make the rebuttal clear? Is it clear from the introduction that this is a rebuttal essay? Comment in the margins of the essay.

III. Look for areas that are weak, illogical, or need more support. Provide comments on the essay.
   A. Does your classmate explain why the author of the essay holds his specific stance?
   B. Does your classmate explain why his or her stance is better? Does your classmate sufficiently explain how his or her solution will actually solve the problem?
   C. If your classmate does provide specific examples, does he or she use adequate explanation of those examples to show how they connect to his or her claims throughout the essay?
   D. Does anything your classmate say lack enough supporting evidence to convince the author of the article he or she is rebutting?

IV. What is the best part of the paper? Why?

V. What suggestions do you have for your classmate to make the rebuttal argument more effective?
ORGANIZATION CHECKERS

I. Check the outline against the essay. Is the Roman numeral I consistent with the first body paragraph in the essay? Continue this process through the sub-points and the rest of the outline. Write in the margin of the essay if the author does not follow the outline.

II. Turn to the essay text. On the thesis, write number 1 over the first main point you expect to see discussed in the paper, number 2 over the second main point you expect to see, and number 3 over the third main point you expect to see.

III. Looking at the numbers you just wrote on the thesis statement, read the controlling sentence of the corresponding main body paragraphs.
   A. Do they match your labeled numbers? Make a note on the paper if the person needs to change something.
   B. Does each controlling sentence reference the writer of the original essay, his or her claim, and your classmate’s refutation or counterargument? Each controlling sentence should be arguable and function like a mini-thesis statement.

IV. Read each paragraph. Is the paragraph unified?
   A. Does the paragraph keep to the main point mentioned in the controlling sentence?
   B. Does it begin to make a different point or lose track of the argument point altogether?
   C. Is there a concluding sentence present? Does it wrap-up the discussion by referring to elements in the controlling sentence elements?
   D. Is there a hook or a lead-in sentence at the end of the paragraph? Make a note for the author to remove this sentence and create a concluding sentence.

V. Transition words or phrases (such as “however,” in addition to,” or “also) provide a link between sentences and ideas.
   A. Highlight any transition words you find and write a note explaining if they are effective or not.
   B. Put a star and a note in any location where a transition is needed. Look at controlling sentences and inside paragraphs where links are needed. Some suggestions include: furthermore, in addition, another example, on the other hand, contrary to, etc.
I. Draw boxes around each use of source information within the paper; include the signal tag and ending citation.
   A. If there is no author or the source is a newspaper article, make note that the source cannot be used.
   B. Confirm that each one has both a signal tag and an ending citation. If something is missing, make a note.
   C. Confirm that each source within the paper is listed on the Works Cited page. Make notes where appropriate if information is missing.

II. Pick one of your classmate's sources.
   A. Find each instance of this source's use in the student's paper.
      1. Is the author's full name and some form of credibility included in the signal tag the first time the source is used?
      2. Does the author's last name (only) appear in either the signal tag or the ending citation (not both) for each successive use of this source? If not, make a note where appropriate.
   B. Check the first Direct Quote against the original source by reading the source paragraph from which it comes.
      1. Does the context of the original paragraph change the meaning of the quote your classmate used? If so, make a note in the margins of your classmate's essay.
      2. Does the student's use of this source make sense in this particular paragraph? Does the quote add something to your classmate's argument?
      3. Does the use of this source make sense? Does it add something to your classmate's argument?
      4. Is the quote copied exactly like the original? Are any omissions indicated with ellipses ... ? Are any additions or alterations indicated with brackets [ ]?
   C. Check the Sentence of Incorporation (SOI). Is it merely restating/summarizing the source material, or does it explain how the source supports your classmate's argument?
   D. Find the other time(s) your classmate uses this source in the paper, and follow the appropriate steps from instructions B & C.

III. Repeat the above steps for the other sources. When finished, leave a note for your classmate explaining what (s)he is doing well with source integration and how (s)he can improve.
**Sentence & Format Checkers**

**Sentence Errors:**

Skim through the essay looking for the following:

I. Draw a box around any contractions (it's, you're, can't, won't, etc.) If you find them outside of a quotation, they should be removed from the essay.

II. Draw a box around any of the following words. If you find them outside of a quotation, they should be removed: [I me mine we our us your your There are/were]

III. Identify any pronoun-antecedent disagreements you can find. In order to do so, circle the following words if you find them – they may or may not need to be corrected:

   [He/She They Their One His/her It is]

   Then Draw an arrow to the noun being referenced by those words you just circled. Do they match (single with single, plural with plural)? Make a note in the margin if the author needs to change something.

IV. Label any sentence fragments you find.

V. Label any run-ons that you find.

VI. Label any comma splices you find.

VII. Write down questions beside any awkward sentences you discover.

**Format Errors:**

I. Check spacing:

   A. Margins ~1 inch. What about the bottom margin? Is it greater than 1 inch? Tell your author to change his or her bottom margin to .9, which will take care of the problem.

   B. Are there extra spaces between paragraphs? Or between heading elements? Mark this in the margins.

II. Check heading and page numbers:

   A. The heading (student author's name, GSA name, Course, and date) goes on two pages: the first page of the outline, and the first page of the essay text. It does NOT go on the works cited page.

   B. The page numbers begin on the first page of the outline (student author's last name and the page's number) and continue throughout the essay. The works cited page will have the last number on it.

III. Outline format:

   A. A creative title?

   B. Thesis should be directly under the title.

   C. Roman numerals each have sub-points? If not, make a note in the margin.

   D. If there is an A, then there must be a B. If there is a 1, then there must be a 2.

   E. Length? For this essay, the outline should be at least 1 ½ pages in length. If it is not, make a note.

IV. Is the essay long enough? It should be 3 full pages in length and no more than 3.5 (fold the last page in half).

V. Works Cited page:

   A. Works are in alphabetical order by the author's last name?

   B. Hanging indent?
The not-so Brainless Athletes

Thesis: Donald Vroon statement that sports are for the brainless masses, not for the people with brains, is flawed because sports requires intellect and physical fitness, teaches people important life lessons, and teaches how to control the individual emotions.

I. Although Vroon thinks that athletes are dumb, athletes are actually intelligent because each individual sport requires brains as well as physical fitness to achieve in.
   A. Donald Vroon believes that sports are for the stupid masses not for himself or other smart people.
   B. Vroon’s claim about brainless athletes is false because each sport requires the athlete to study some type of playbook or background information on the event and must know the rules and regulations.

II. Another flawed claim by Vroon is he states that sports is just all crap and very little quality left in sports, but in sports it teaches characteristics of high achievers in positive personality.
   A. Vroon believes that sports are all the crap about sportsmanship is just talk there’s very little left of that quality left in sports, it also encourages no sportsmanship greed brutality fighting gambling and poor manners.
   B. Vroon’s claim is wrong because each individual sport teaches an individual some type of life lesson that he or she needs to be better in life, whether the lesson be to never give up or strive to be the best no matter what.
The not-so Brainless Athletes

In the article “The Stupidty of Sports,” Donald Vroon makes specific assumptions about individuals who play sports. He infers that every person who plays a sport is unintelligent and is an aggressive egotistical person held bent on self desires. While Donald believes that athletes are dumb, musicians and people like himself are the brains and culture of society. In his article he tries to cite sources that show how everyone so wrapped up in sports misses out on the details of aggression and self desired of the athletes. Donald Vroon statement that sports are for the brainless masses, not for the people with brains, is flawed because sports requires intellect as well as physical fitness, teaches people important life lessons, and teaches how to control the individual emotions.

Although Vroon thinks that athletes are dumb, athletes are actually intelligent because each individual sport requires brains as well as physical fitness to achieve in. According to Doanld Vroon who wrote ,“The Stupidty of Sports” “I have always held the view that sports is what people have when they have no culture”(49). While this can be true in some cases, not everyone is brainless or has no culture. Each sport requires the athlete have to study some type of playbook or background information on the event. In every sport, the athlete must know of the rules and regulations put there by the commissioners. According to an author, John Bradley “Our results suggest that participating in individual sports confers a further benefit to academic results because of the enhanced positive personality characteristics of conscientiousness and autonomy
associated with these sports” (12). After testing kids out to see who had the better grades, they tested kids who were participating in extracurricular activities versus kids who did not. This led John to his results which were stated above, that shows the sports increase the academic achievement of students. Although it might not show right away, sports increase the academic achievement and GPA of athletes. Even though the stereotypical athlete is considered to be brainless, many studies have shown that sports increases intelligence no matter the age group.

Another flawed claim by Vroon is he states that sports is “all crap and very little quality left in sports,” but in sports it teaches characteristics of high achievers in positive personality. Vroon believes that “athletes are just angry aggressive egotistical people, and also encourage no sportsmanship, agreed, brutality, fighting, gambling, and poor manners” (Vroon 49). While there are flaws in every sport, most individuals usually get some type of lesson out of the sport. Although people may never be able tell whether the individual has learned anything many athletes have lunch never give up and always strive to be the best. Bradley notes that “[s]tudies investigating the personality characteristics of high achievers in education suggest key indicators are motivational strategies, self-regulation and self-efficacy. These characteristics of high achievers are consistent with the high levels of conscientiousness and extraversion identified in athletes participating in different sports” (11). As Bradley indicates from his studies, the nonathletes did not have the certain characteristics of a higher achiever. These characteristics seem to designate higher achievement; which athletes seem to have over nonathletes. Sports today teaches athletes more than just how be athletic, it shows he or she how to be motivated and self-regulation compared to what the most popular opinions believe that athletes have no sportsmanship.

***Additional content has been deleted***
Work Cited


I have always held the view that sports is what people have when they have no culture. Sports are for the stupid masses, not for people with brains. Where I grew up (near New York) that was pretty much the case. I was surrounded in school with very bright people, and I can’t recall a single discussion of, say, football. There was some interest in the World Series of baseball, but it was never profound among the brightest students.

Years later, in 1983, the New York Times published the results of a survey that showed that only 3.7 percent of the American population is completely uninterested in sports. I was quite unprepared for that statistic, even though by then I had lived in the Midwest, where sports were life-encompassing. I knew college students who missed exams rather than miss their local high school’s basketball finals. I thought they were crazy—and worse. I thought their values were askew. I thought they were morally wrong!

That same survey showed that 6 out of 10 Americans considered athletes the best role models children can have! Again, that is completely incomprehensible to me. If my son decided he wanted to be like some famous athlete I would know I had failed as a parent. And 3 out of 4 Americans encouraged their children to participate in sports—another mistake. As one professional player said at the time, if a boy spends his high school and college years playing football, the chances are 95 percent that he will suffer a serious injury. That player commented that "concussion is the common cold of football". It is a fundamentally brutal game—for some people that is part of its appeal. But serious athletes often suffer the rest of their lives from their injuries. High school sports can look less like healthy exercise than a sophisticated form of child abuse.

And all the crap about "sportsmanship" is just talk. There is very little of that quality left in sports.

In Ashley Montague’s book, *The Nature of Human Aggression*, he quotes a scholar who says that wherever you find a warlike society, there you will find combative sports. The two reinforce each other. "Much evidence shows that sporting contests, far from siphoning off or deflecting or sublimating aggression, tend in fact to reinforce it and even to exacerbate it." Even among children, competitive sports evoke and worsen aggressiveness. The National Commission on the Causes and Prevention of Violence deplored the reigning competitive attitude of winning at all costs. If we allow so much aggression in sports, naturally sports will encourage aggression. Why is aggression between men celebrated but affection between men deplored? This is what you expect in a warlike society—in Sparta rather than Athens.

Sports has come to matter way too much. These are only games, after all, but look at the violence they give rise to all over the world. Look at the social nastiness losers suffer! Look at the loss of face and confidence. (Losing at one of those games drastically reduces male hormones.) "The cult of victory has made savages of the players and rabid chauvinists of their followers.... People today associate rivalry with boundless aggression. Competitive sports have made us a nation of militarists, fascists, and predatory egotists, have encouraged poor sportsmanship in all social relations; and have extinguished cooperation and compassion." (Christopher Lasch, in *The Culture of Narcissism*—it is obvious these days, isn’t it, that what he said applies to politics.)

Athletics is a coercion into conformity. It suits our warlike society to train children to fight from the earliest years. Boys often consciously hope to see violence and blood; they think that real men must be ready to smash each other into insensibility. They think that a male who won’t fight isn’t a real man—yet many of them go to church once a week to worship a man who taught non-resistance and non-violence.

But sports has become a religion to very many young men. They know current batting averages and team lineups, but they have never read a word of Shakespeare or the Bible, and they don’t know what is in the Bill of Rights. Sports has its immortals, its shrines, its rituals and annual observances—and they take up any waking hours not devoted to school or the media. Someone said that the USA has become a jockocracy. The playing of games is no longer a hobby or a diversion; it has turned into an obsession. And this seems to apply at all class levels in this country now. It’s the path of least resistance; everybody seems to be
involved in it and talking about it. It is hard to converse with anyone if you know nothing about it. It is hard to have a social life if you don’t go to games or at least watch them on television. Eternal boyhood is the dream of the average male (as eternal girlhood is of the female), and that plays out in rather infantile identification with athletes—and the result is arrested development.

Sports stars are the best-known personalities, the highest paid, the most applauded. The stadiums vastly outdraw the churches, no matter what the weather. (On a nasty early winter Sunday the churches were half empty here in Cincinnati, but the stadium was crowded with freezing people later the same day.) Sports are our communal ritual and ceremony, and winning has become very, very important—to the point where all kinds of cheating are accepted and assumed.

Some churches join in the hero worship of sports celebrities and even invite them to preach. (Some churches will do anything to attract people.) Surely there is a huge and basic conflict between the aggression and ego worship of sports and authentic Christianity.

Sports has become a huge industry—even college sports—and a lucrative one. It’s a big commercial spectacle that millions of people seem to want to follow. Its stars are entertainers and like entertainers earn outrageous sums. (Baseball players averaged $34,000 in 1969 but now average—average—close to $3 million. College football coaches often earn that, too.) Its stadiums, often built at public expense, rake in millions for teams and owners. One writer called them "$500 million welfare hotels for America’s billionaires built with funds that should have been spent on clinics, schools, and libraries". Indeed. It is a crime to build stadiums with tax money, and here in Cincinnati—only one example—we will all be paying for those stadiums for the rest of our lives. They were funded by a sales tax increase. That hits even the poorest people, and it will never be repealed. Welfare for millionaires is the American way, of course. Look at our national tax structure.

Commercial sports is not a natural activity; it has grown way out of proportion to its importance. It encourages not sportsmanship but greed and brutality, fighting and gambling and poor manners. Big-time intercollegiate athletic program are mockeries of everything higher education stands for. Winning national championships is far more important to most American universities than teaching people to think and find meaning in life. At the University of Cincinnati, athletics is subsidized to the tune of $11 million a year, while other departments are forced to cut back. The subsidy is much greater at many southern and western schools (Alabama, Colorado).

"Physical education" is the excuse for many a sports program, but there are very few physical educators. Almost no one is interested in educating individuals to discover and use their own physical resources to create a healthier life for themselves. The teachers are coaches, and their only real interest is in creating ever-better professionals to entertain a flabby culture where almost no one is physically fit. I had one Phys Ed teacher in college who told us right away that his goal was to get us interested in physical exercise that would stand us in good stead all our lives—not some sport that we would burn ourselves out with before we were 30. He was certainly the exception.

Andrew Greeley, in his book of essays called A Piece of My Mind, argues that if we let children under 16 play sports we must be sure no adults are allowed to watch. We should rule out anything that smacks of "professionalism" in sports in our educational institutions (including college). If kids want to play they can organize clubs. One parent responded to that with the usual propaganda: “But sports are what life is all about. Life is competitive, and you have to learn to win under pressure.”

As Mr Greeley comments, that is not really true. In sports there is only one winner or team of winners; but in life many can win, and one person’s success does not make everyone else losers. You do not make it in life at the expense of others—or at least you needn’t. But if you were an athlete all your life you may see it that way—even want it that way! Competitive athletics is a pretty poor preparation for life—at least for what matters in life. Sports distort reality—not just for children, but for everyone. An article in Psychology Today quite a few years back reported a study that showed “no empirical support for the tradition that sports builds character”. Indeed, they found evidence that athletic competition retards growth in some areas.

Paul Theroux once commented on how few athletes are gentlemen. "Just as high school basketball teaches you to be a poor loser...sports seems little more than a recipe for creating bad marriages, social misfits, moral degenerates, sadists, latent rapists, and just plain louts. I regard high school sports as a drug far worse than marijuana." He goes on to say that the quest for manliness in sports is right-wing, puritanical, cowardly, and neurotic. "All the creative arts are obnoxious to the manly ideal, because at their best the arts are pursued by uncompetitive and essentially solitary people." (NY Times Magazine, 11-27-83)

The Jews of Biblical times had no use for athletics and considered them suspect. Part of
their disapproval was probably because of the nudity that went along with sports and training in the Greek world. But there was more to it than that. I’m sure they realized that there was something anti-Jewish about it all, something that contradicted what they believed about God and how he should be served. Early Christians mostly shared this Jewish suspicion of athletics and also refused military service. One wonders where Christians of today get their values. It’s obviously not from Jesus or our Jewish roots. They clearly fail to understand how profoundly un-Christian our American culture is.

I can’t resist adding into the picture how utterly boring football and baseball games are. In a typical Super Bowl telecast, only 3 percent of the time is devoted to actual live play—in one study, 7 minutes, in another—another year—10 minutes. These are four-hour telecasts! People who can sit and watch all that must be mentally deficient.

In Bero Rigauer’s 1981 book, Sport and Work, he argued that the pressure for greater and greater achievement has dehumanized the athlete and corrupted the purpose of sport. It has become work: specialized, bureaucratized, and repressive. Modern sports, he says, should be replaced by spontaneous play and non-competitive games. Almost any critical observer would agree with him.

A ballet dancer who was once a major college football player considers ballet much harder and much better physical training than football. He has lost a lot of unnecessary bulk; he is leaner and carries his body more efficiently. And his body is far better trained.

What’s more, the ballet dancer is not forced into a ridiculous assumed masculinity. That is part of what is wrong with sports. It is too bad that we have so much exaggerated masculinity and femininity. What we need is a common humanity. Among the races, blacks seem to exaggerate the gender variations the most and Asians the least. That is partly nature: blacks produce far more sex hormones than whites, and Asians less than either. But as a result (and it’s self-reinforcing) black societies are more violent than white ones, and Asian ones the least of all. Why emphasize and glorify characteristics that encourage violence?

Part of what makes musicians far greater human beings than athletes is that musicians are more simply human—less competitive, more cooperative, less masculine, less feminine, just more human. The best human beings are less contaminated by competition or gender. I don’t respect very masculine or very feminine people of either gender (that includes very feminine men and very masculine women). It was Cocteau who said “the artist must be partly male and partly female”.

It’s true. Just about every musician I have ever known is exactly that. It’s not at all a matter of sexual attraction: musicians can be gay or straight. But they live in a world where that doesn’t matter—and it truly doesn’t. Give me gentle humanity in place of simpering femininity or roaring masculinity. How can anyone stand women who burst into tears at the slightest provocation and are always trying to get men to coddle them like helpless babies? How can anyone stand the strutting athlete who walks around with a chip on his shoulder, always looking for someone to pick a fight with? How childish both extremes are! I’ll take musicians over sports figures (and over the classic “baby-doll” woman) any day as models for us all of real humanity. ✶

VROON

Citation:
I. Does the thesis statement include the audience (writer of the original essay), his or her claim, and your classmate’s refutation or counter-argument? Label them above the thesis on the essay.

II. Does the introduction make the rebuttal clear? Is it clear from the introduction that this is a rebuttal essay? Comment in the margins of the essay.

III. Look for areas that are weak, illogical, or need more support. Provide comments on the essay.
   A. Does your classmate explain why the author of the essay holds his specific stance?
   B. Does your classmate explain why his or her stance is better? Does your classmate sufficiently explain how his or her solution will actually solve the problem?
   C. If your classmate does provide specific examples, does he or she use adequate explanation of those examples to show how they connect to his or her claims throughout the essay?
   D. Does anything your classmate say lack enough supporting evidence to convince the author of the article he or she is rebutting?

IV. What is the best part of the paper? Why?

V. What suggestions do you have for your classmate to make the rebuttal argument more effective?
ORGANIZATION CHECKERS

I. Check the outline against the essay. Is the Roman numeral I consistent with the first body paragraph in the essay? Continue this process through the sub-points and the rest of the outline. Write in the margin of the essay if the author does not follow the outline.

II. Turn to the essay text. On the thesis, write number 1 over the first main point you expect to see discussed in the paper, number 2 over the second main point you expect to see, and number 3 over the third main point you expect to see.

III. Looking at the numbers you just wrote on the thesis statement, read the controlling sentence of the corresponding main body paragraphs.
   A. Do they match your labeled numbers? Make a note on the paper if the person needs to change something.
   B. Does each controlling sentence reference the writer of the original essay, his or her claim, and your classmate's refutation or counterargument? Each controlling sentence should be arguable and function like a mini-thesis statement.

IV. Read each paragraph. Is the paragraph unified?
   A. Does the paragraph keep to the main point mentioned in the controlling sentence?
   B. Does it begin to make a different point or lose track of the argument point altogether?
   C. Is there a concluding sentence present? Does it wrap-up the discussion by referring to elements in the controlling sentence elements?
   D. Is there a hook or a lead-in sentence at the end of the paragraph? Make a note for the author to remove this sentence and create a concluding sentence.

V. Transition words or phrases (such as “however,” in addition to,” or “also) provide a link between sentences and ideas.
   A. Highlight any transition words you find and write a note explaining if they are effective or not.
   B. Put a star and a note in any location where a transition is needed. Look at controlling sentences and inside paragraphs where links are needed. Some suggestions include: furthermore, in addition, another example, on the other hand, contrary to, etc.
SOURCE MATERIAL CHECKERS

I. Draw boxes around each use of source information within the paper; include the signal tag and ending citation.
   A. If there is no author or the source is a newspaper article, make note that the source cannot be used.
   B. Confirm that each one has both a signal tag and an ending citation. If something is missing, make a note.
   C. Confirm that each source within the paper is listed on the Works Cited page. Make notes where appropriate if information is missing.

II. Pick one of your classmate’s sources.
   A. Find each instance of this source’s use in the student’s paper.
      1. Is the author’s full name and some form of credibility included in the signal tag the first time the source is used?
      2. Does the author’s last name (only) appear in either the signal tag or the ending citation (not both) for each successive use of this source? If not, make a note where appropriate.
   B. Check the first Direct Quote against the original source by reading the source paragraph from which it comes.
      1. Does the context of the original paragraph change the meaning of the quote your classmate used? If so, make a note in the margins of your classmate’s essay.
      2. Does the student’s use of this source make sense in this particular paragraph? Does the quote add something to your classmate’s argument?
      3. Does the use of this source make sense? Does it add something to your classmate’s argument?
      4. Is the quote copied exactly like the original? Are any omissions indicated with ellipses …? Are any additions or alterations indicated with brackets [ ]?
   C. Check the Sentence of Incorporation (SOI). Is it merely restating/summarizing the source material, or does it explain how the source supports your classmate’s argument?
   D. Find the other time(s) your classmate uses this source in the paper, and follow the appropriate steps from instructions B & C.

III. Repeat the above steps for the other sources. When finished, leave a note for your classmate explaining what (s)he is doing well with source integration and how (s)he can improve.
SEN TENCE & FOR MAT FORMAT CHECKERS

Sentence Errors:
Skim through the essay looking for the following:
I. Draw a box around any contractions (it’s, you’re, can’t, won’t, etc.) If you find them outside of a quota-
tion, they should be removed from the essay.
II. Draw a box around any of the following words. If you find them outside of a quotation, they should be
removed: [I me mine we our us your There are/were]
III. Identify any pronoun-antecedent disagreements you can find. In order to do so, circle the following
words if you find them – they may or may not need to be corrected:
[He/She They Their One His/her It is]
Then Draw an arrow to the noun being referenced by those words you just circled. Do they match
(single with single, plural with plural)? Make a note in the margin if the author needs to change some-
thing.
IV. Label any sentence fragments you find.
V. Label any run-ons that you find.
VI. Label any comma splices you find.
VII. Write down questions beside any awkward sentences you discover.

Format Errors:
I. Check spacing:
A. Margins ~1 inch. What about the bottom margin? Is it greater than 1 inch? Tell your author to
change his or her bottom margin to .9, which will take care of the problem.
B. Are there extra spaces between paragraphs? Or between heading elements? Mark this in the mar-
gins.
II. Check heading and page numbers:
A. The heading (student author’s name, GSA name, Course, and date) goes on two pages: the first page
of the outline, and the first page of the essay text. It does NOT go on the works cited page.
B. The page numbers begin on the first page of the outline (student author’s last name and the page's
number) and continue throughout the essay. The works cited page will have the last number on it.
III. Outline format:
A. A creative title?
B. Thesis should be directly under the title.
C. Roman numerals each have sub-points? If not, make a note in the margin.
D. If there is an A, then there must be a B. If there is a 1, then there must be a 2.
E. Length? For this essay, the outline should be at least 1 ½ pages in length. If it is not, make a note.
IV. Is the essay long enough? It should be 3 full pages in length and no more than 3.5 (fold the last page in half).
V. Works Cited page:
A. Works are in alphabetical order by the author's last name?
B. Hanging indent?
The Good in Forgiveness

Thesis: Author Bob Brody says that holding a grudge is a healing power, however holding a grudge is harmful because holding a grudge makes someone angrier, grudges can make a person start to hate another person, and holding grudges can make ruin relationships.

I. Bob Brody says that holding a grudge is beneficial; however, when a person forgives someone who wronged or hurt them, it will make the person feel better about the situation.
   A. Brody says that holding a grudge is beneficial because when a person holds a grudge they tend to feel better about the situation,
   B. Holding a grudge can do a person more harm than good because it is emotionally draining and after a while a person may forget why they are holding a grudge in the first place.

II. Brody says that a person does not have to forgive someone, but, before a person can forgive someone, they must be able to forgive themselves.
   A. Author Bob Brody is not against forgiveness but he has only forgiven people under certain circumstances.
   B. When a person is able to forgive themselves first, they are able to forgive others more easily.

***Additional content has been deleted***
The Good in Forgiveness

Forgiveness has been known to heal relationships and restore broken hearts. When a person forgives someone, they often become closer as friends and are more willing to look past the troubles that they once had. Forgiveness is such an important part in every relationship. However, author Bob Brody’s claim that holding a grudge is a healing power is flawed because holding a grudge is harmful because holding a grudge makes someone angrier, grudges can make a person start to hate another person, and grudges ruins relationships.

Bob Brody says that holding a grudge is beneficial; however, when a person forgives someone who wronged them, it will make the person feel better about the situation. But, holding a grudge is not beneficial at all because when someone holds a grudge, they are only causing pain, not only to the other person but to themselves as well. Brody says that holding a grudge is beneficial because when a person holds a grudge they tend to feel better about the situation. Holding a grudge only makes a person angrier and more hateful to the person they are holding grudge against. Holding a grudge can do a person more harm than good because it is emotionally draining. Grudge holding is tiring because a person is trying too hard to stay mad at the person who wronged them. Overall, people should not hold grudges because it is emotionally draining and it is not healthy.

Brody says that a person does not have to forgive someone, but, before a person can forgive someone, they must be able to forgive themselves. Author Zenon Szablowinski says, “An inability to forgive oneself or others not uncommonly results in the strongest and most negative
psychological conditions than can arise in human experience” (678). Forgiving oneself is important because when people forgive themselves they are able to forgive others more easily. Brody is not against forgiveness but he has only forgiven people under certain circumstances. He says, “I am not against forgiveness per se; I have forgiven people for rudeness as well as for deep misunderstandings and have done so without holding onto hard feelings” (65). A person should be able to forgive the wrong-doer no matter what the situation is. Whether someone said something bad about a person or hurt someone that they are close to, a person should be willing to forgive the person who hurt them or their loved ones. Szablowinski also says, “Self-forgiveness may be required for hurts done to others or to oneself. In offending others, one also does moral damage to oneself by disregarding one’s moral standards and becoming, for instance, an insensitive, disloyal, abusive or deceitful person” (679). When a person is able to forgive themselves, they are able to forgive others more easily because they are able to admit their faults and are able to be more willing to forgive someone who has hurt them in the past. Forgiveness is important; whether a person needs to forgive themselves or someone else, it is the key to healthy relationships with the people around you.

Bob Brody has stopped talking to people because he is holding a grudge; but, holding a grudge is harmful because when a person holds a grudge, they are hurting relationships that once meant something. Brody claims, “I have chosen to stop speaking to certain people permanently and occasionally speak ill of them—but more with incredulity than sense of revenge” (65). But, according to Szablowinski, “Forgiveness is not denying but bringing to full light the truth about the unfairness in the offense” (472). Many people have lost friends because they are too busy being mad and holding a grudge against someone who has hurt them. Brody says that because he held a grudge against certain people, he has stopped talking to them and he feels good about

***Additional content has been deleted***
Works Cited


Is It Just Me?

To Forgive Is Good
But sometimes I want to stay mad  BY BOB BRODY

Some years ago, a barrage of thumping, galloping noises routinely issued from the apartment upstairs as if baby elephants were competing in 50-yard dashes. I went up one day to politely inquire. “No, nobody’s making any noise here,” the husband and wife both insisted. “It must be coming from elsewhere in the building.” Two children about five years old, each holding soccer balls, stood right beside their parents. “Could the thumping be your kids running around, perhaps playing soccer?” I asked.

“Oh, no, we never let the kids play in the house.” For months, the pattern continued: the thumping and galloping above, our delicate check-in, the denial. It got so that every time I saw the couple, I glared without a word of greeting. When they moved out of the building, the thumping stopped.

I suppose I could have forgiven my neighbors this infraction and spared them the glare. After all, forgiveness is in, a trend spawning bestselling books, foundations, and research institutes. The notion has gone well beyond spiritual leaders advising that forgiveness is good for the soul and that hard feelings will turn us bitter and hostile. Now the medical community cites studies showing that forgiveness can prevent heart attacks, lower blood pressure, and even ease depression.

I may be outnumbered, but I still believe in the healing power of the grudge. I’ve deployed grudges with an equal-opportunity sense of fairness—against teachers and classmates, bosses and colleagues, family and friends. I’ve chosen to stop speaking to certain people permanently and occasionally even spoken ill of them—but more with incredulity than a sense of revenge. I’m neither proud nor ashamed. But I’ve discovered that nothing feels quite as satisfying as having a grudge well nursed.

I had a boss who took a dislike to me from my first day on the job, even though she’d hired me. There were no complaints about my performance, but I later learned she’d lied to co-workers about me. Without explanation, she laid me off after only ten weeks, just before Thanksgiving. I had a family to support. Was I to forgive her? Should I now? Give me one good reason. My grudge against her balanced out that injustice, somehow righted the universe. It has kept me warm on many a cold night.

Is it just me? Under the new mandate of blanket absolution, should I forgive the cousin who invited us to dinner only to make an Amway pitch? Or the friend who sent me a public relations client and then harassed me for months for a 10 percent finder’s fee?

I’m not against forgiveness per se; I have forgiven people for rudeness as well as for deep misunderstandings and have done so without holding on to hard feelings. What I deplore is the propaganda about forgiveness. No longer an option, forgiveness is an edict. Forgiving so democratically cheapens the very act.

A long-standing grudge suggests that we hold certain standards, that we respect ourselves enough to reject bad behavior. Failure to forgive can be just as righteous, just as honorable, as forgiveness itself.

When someone apologizes, however, with sincerity, not calculation, it can make a difference. I had a close friend in high school who ditched me after college and has avoided me for all the decades since. At our 15th high school reunion, I had the chance to ask him why. He said that he had always made him feel inferior, as if he gave offense. And he had a point: I’d made fun of him—I’d thought good-naturedly—until he withdrew. Face-to-face at our reunion, I apologized. He declined. I know how it feels to go unforgiven. And guess what? It feels deserved.
REBUTTAL ARGUMENT STATIONS PEER REVIEW

I. Does the thesis statement include the audience (writer of the original essay), his or her claim, and your classmate’s refutation or counter-argument? Label them above the thesis on the essay.

II. Does the introduction make the rebuttal clear? Is it clear from the introduction that this is a rebuttal essay? Comment in the margins of the essay.

III. Look for areas that are weak, illogical, or need more support. Provide comments on the essay.
   A. Does your classmate explain why the author of the essay holds his specific stance?
   B. Does your classmate explain why his or her stance is better? Does your classmate sufficiently explain how his or her solution will actually solve the problem?
   C. If your classmate does provide specific examples, does he or she use adequate explanation of those examples to show how they connect to his or her claims throughout the essay?
   D. Does anything your classmate say lack enough supporting evidence to convince the author of the article he or she is rebutting?

IV. What is the best part of the paper? Why?

V. What suggestions do you have for your classmate to make the rebuttal argument more effective?
Student Three

Author's Name: _____________________________

Peer Reviewer's Name: ________________________

ORGANIZATION CHECKERS

I. Check the outline against the essay. Is the Roman numeral I consistent with the first body paragraph in the essay? Continue this process through the sub-points and the rest of the outline. Write in the margin of the essay if the author does not follow the outline.

II. Turn to the essay text. On the thesis, write number 1 over the first main point you expect to see discussed in the paper, number 2 over the second main point you expect to see, and number 3 over the third main point you expect to see.

III. Looking at the numbers you just wrote on the thesis statement, read the controlling sentence of the corresponding main body paragraphs.
   A. Do they match your labeled numbers? Make a note on the paper if the person needs to change something.
   B. Does each controlling sentence reference the writer of the original essay, his or her claim, and your classmate's refutation or counterargument? Each controlling sentence should be arguable and function like a mini-thesis statement.

IV. Read each paragraph. Is the paragraph unified?
   A. Does the paragraph keep to the main point mentioned in the controlling sentence?
   B. Does it begin to make a different point or lose track of the argument point altogether?
   C. Is there a concluding sentence present? Does it wrap-up the discussion by referring to elements in the controlling sentence elements?
   D. Is there a hook or a lead-in sentence at the end of the paragraph? Make a note for the author to remove this sentence and create a concluding sentence.

V. Transition words or phrases (such as “however,” in addition to, or “also) provide a link between sentences and ideas.
   A. Highlight any transition words you find and write a note explaining if they are effective or not.
   B. Put a star and a note in any location where a transition is needed. Look at controlling sentences and inside paragraphs where links are needed. Some suggestions include: furthermore, in addition, another example, on the other hand, contrary to, etc.
I. Draw boxes around each use of source information within the paper; include the signal tag and ending citation.
   A. If there is no author or the source is a newspaper article, make note that the source cannot be used.
   B. Confirm that each one has both a signal tag and an ending citation. If something is missing, make a note.
   C. Confirm that each source within the paper is listed on the Works Cited page. Make notes where appropriate if information is missing.

II. Pick one of your classmate’s sources.
   A. Find each instance of this source’s use in the student’s paper.
      1. Is the author’s full name and some form of credibility included in the signal tag the first time the source is used?
      2. Does the author’s last name (only) appear in either the signal tag or the ending citation (not both) for each successive use of this source? If not, make a note where appropriate.
   B. Check the first Direct Quote against the original source by reading the source paragraph from which it comes.
      1. Does the context of the original paragraph change the meaning of the quote your classmate used? If so, make a note in the margins of your classmate’s essay.
      2. Does the student’s use of this source make sense in this particular paragraph? Does the quote add something to your classmate’s argument?
      3. Does the use of this source make sense? Does it add something to your classmate’s argument?
      4. Is the quote copied exactly like the original? Are any omissions indicated with ellipses …? Are any additions or alterations indicated with brackets [ ]?
   C. Check the Sentence of Incorporation (SOI). Is it merely restating/summarizing the source material, or does it explain how the source supports your classmate’s argument?
   D. Find the other time(s) your classmate uses this source in the paper, and follow the appropriate steps from instructions B & C.

III. Repeat the above steps for the other sources. When finished, leave a note for your classmate explaining what (s)he is doing well with source integration and how (s)he can improve.
Sentence & Format Checkers

Sentence Errors:
Skim through the essay looking for the following:
I. Draw a box around any contractions (it's, you're, can't, won't, etc.) If you find them outside of a quotation, they should be removed from the essay.
II. Draw a box around any of the following words. If you find them outside of a quotation, they should be removed: [I me mine we our us your There are/were)
III. Identify any pronoun-antecedent disagreements you can find. In order to do so, circle the following words if you find them – they may or may not need to be corrected:
   [He/She They Their One His/her It is]
   Then Draw an arrow to the noun being referenced by those words you just circled. Do they match (single with single, plural with plural)? Make a note in the margin if the author needs to change something.
IV. Label any sentence fragments you find.
V. Label any run-ons that you find.
VI. Label any comma splices you find.
VII. Write down questions beside any awkward sentences you discover.

Format Errors:
I. Check spacing:
   A. Margins ~1 inch. What about the bottom margin? Is it greater than 1 inch? Tell your author to change his or her bottom margin to .9, which will take care of the problem.
   B. Are there extra spaces between paragraphs? Or between heading elements? Mark this in the margins.
II. Check heading and page numbers:
   A. The heading (student author's name, GSA name, Course, and date) goes on two pages: the first page of the outline, and the first page of the essay text. It does NOT go on the works cited page.
   B. The page numbers begin on the first page of the outline (student author's last name and the page's number) and continue throughout the essay. The works cited page will have the last number on it.
III. Outline format:
   A. A creative title?
   B. Thesis should be directly under the title.
   C. Roman numerals each have sub-points? If not, make a note in the margin.
   D. If there is an A, then there must be a B. If there is a 1, then there must be a 2.
   E. Length? For this essay, the outline should be at least 1 ½ pages in length. If it is not, make a note.
IV. Is the essay long enough? It should be 3 full pages in length and no more than 3.5 (fold the last page in half).
V. Works Cited page:
   A. Works are in alphabetical order by the author's last name?
   B. Hanging indent?
To Spank or Not To Spank

Nancy Samalin and Catherine Whitney’s claim on why it is wrong to spank children is flawed because children misbehaving is not the parents fault, children learn right from wrong, and children understand the reason why they are being spanked.

I. Samalin and Whitney claim that the parents are the problem, not the children; but it is impossible for parents to completely child proof a child’s surroundings, children should obey when they are told to leave something alone.

A. Samalin and Whitney claim that parents should have put away what they did not want the child to touch.

B. Parents are not able to put away every item that poses a threat or is off limits to the child.

II. Samalin and Whitney claim that spanking is wrong because it does not teach the child right from wrong, but when children are spanked correctly they begin to learn from their mistakes.

A. Samalin and Whitney claim children do not know right from wrong, but this is not the case.

B. Children do understand right from wrong and spanking helps to teach them to always strive to do right.

***Additional content has been deleted***
To Spank or Not To Spank

Parents in the world today are trying to forgo the long used form of discipline, spanking. For many years spanking has been a successful way of disciplining. Nancy Samalin and Catherine Whitney’s claim on how it is wrong to spank children is flawed because children misbehaving is not the parents fault, children learn right from wrong, and children understand the reason why they are being spanked.

In the article by Samalin and Whitney we are posed with different stories of parents who spanked their children for playing with something they were not supposed to. In the article it was not the child’s fault though, the article blames the parents for not placing the items out of reach from the children. This statement is flawed; it is impossible to have every potentially harmful item out of a child’s reach. Plug outlets, bathtubs, and even cabinet doors can pose a threat to a child, but that does not mean that parents are the problem if the child slams his or her fingers in a cabinet door. Parents who try to keep everything out of reach of their children, would never do anything else. In an article written by Nancy Samalin and Catherine Whitney it is noted, “Chances are once you’ve had some time to cool down you won’t feel so inclined to spank” (36). This claim suggests that parents only spank because they are angry. In most cases, parents who spank do not do so out of anger but out of love. Parents live a large portion of their lives caring for their children. The majority of parents in this world are loving, nurturing and caring. The parents that fit that description do not seem like the kind of parents that would intentionally
cause harm to their child. It is not enjoyable for a parent to see their children cry, but parents know that children must be spanked in order for them to be successful in life. Author Brigitte Vittrup states, “This type of misbehavior (ignoring parental directive and destruction of property), previously used in other studies is classified as moral transgression and merits punishment according to most children” (213). If the children that are referred to in this quote can recognize something as wrong, then children can be taught right from wrong.

Spanking is meant to teach children right from wrong. Vittrup notes that, “The goal of discipline is to shape the child into being an appropriately self-regulated individual. Self-regulation occurs when the child has internalized a moral norm and thus believes that compliance with the norm is self-generated rather than imposed” (211). Spanking is not a bad thing if it is being used to shape children into responsible individuals. It is when spanking is used for something other than simply teaching right from wrong, in which a problem would arise. That being said, there is a fine line between being too harsh and being a stern parent. Samalin states, “I doubt you were grateful that they cared enough to teach you a lesson” (36). Spanking is not supposed to be a warm and fuzzy feeling, the child did something wrong and must learn from that. A child might be upset or even mad for a few minutes after they get in trouble but it is for the best that they learn. Spanking is a constant that needs to be in children’s lives.

When someone has a stable home life as a child, they are more likely to have a stable life as adults. Author Maayan Davidov states, “[M]others who were relatively more permissive in their practices tended to believe that their children would report negative feelings and self-views after all forms of discipline, yet their children’s actual ratings were considerably less negative than these mothers had expected” (333). Children that had been disciplined permissively did not

***Additional content has been deleted***
Works Cited:


What's wrong with spanking?

By Nancy Samalin with Catherine Whitney

If there is one discipline method that's sure to inspire heated debate, it's spanking. Indeed, a "spare the rod, spoil the child" mentality is making a comeback, and I say that not only because of the surveys and news reports I've seen recently. Even the parents who participate in the workshops I lead on discipline techniques say that in the heat of the moment, it isn't my role, or even my right, to tell people what to do. But personally I am very uncomfortable with spanking and cannot, in good conscience, endorse it as a loving and caring discipline method. Not only have I found it to be ineffective, but I also believe that it sends the wrong message.

Here are the most common dilemmas that lead parents to spank, with suggestions on what to try instead. "Nothing else works." Eighteen-month-old Shaun had just mastered the ability to open his mother's makeup drawer.

Any parent who thinks that hitting encourages better behavior is striking out. There's nothing wrong with an occasional spanking to "teach kids respect." Many tell me that the more benign forms of discipline, such as time-outs, don't work, especially on younger children. They fear that if they don't spank, their kids will end up being spoiled brats. Others say, "I was spanked, and I turned out okay." And even those who don't really "believe" in spanking admit there are times when they can't think of anything else to do.

What's wrong with spanking?

... a lesson children will quickly internalize.

... but he doesn't have the ability to retain the lesson. He may even miss your point entirely, and think not "I did a bad thing" but "I'm a bad person." The most effective form of discipline for a toddler is to make his environment safe for exploration. Shaun's mother finally moved her makeup to a place that he couldn't get to, and he promptly forgot about it. "Sometimes I just lose it." Linda had warned her 3-year-old daughter, Stephanie, over and over again to stay away from the crystal vase that sat on the coffee table. So when Stephanie disobeyed her by examining, and subsequently breaking, the vase, it was the last straw in an already stressful day. Linda gave her daughter a swat on the bottom and...
Kids’ Behavior

discipline

cried, “Bad girl!” Stephanie began to cry and ran out of the room.

After Linda swept up the broken glass, she went to check on her daughter. She found her sitting on the floor of her bedroom vigorously spanking her baby doll while she chanted, “Bad girl, bad girl, bad girl.”

“It was a truly awful moment,” Linda told me. “I realized how out of control I must have seemed to her. I was tired and upset, and I overreacted.”

I sympathized with Linda. It’s a rare parent who doesn’t lose it on occasion. And many parents, when they’re being totally honest, admit that spanking doesn’t usually occur in calm, rational moments. But we have to take a break and handle our anger in other ways—after all, we’re the adults. When you’re really enraged, it’s best to leave the scene until you can calm down. Take a break, hit a pillow, call a friend, write a note, or walk around the block. Chances are, you’ve had some time to cool down before you feel so inclined to spank.

“I only spank to reinforce safety lessons.” Even parents who don’t generally spank say that there are exceptions—especially when the issue is safety. Sarah, for example, described how she spanked her 5-year-old daughter, Suzy, when she ran out into the middle of the street to chase a ball. “If the driver hadn’t slammed on his brakes, Suzy could have been killed. This was serious, and I wanted her to know it. Spanking was the only way to impress upon her that she must look both ways before crossing.”

But two weeks later, Sarah was telling a different story. “I thought Suzy got my message after I spanked her. But a couple of days ago, I let her walk to her friend’s house across the street by herself. As I watched her from our window, I saw that again she didn’t look before crossing. I couldn’t believe that she could still be so careless.”

I suggested a better approach might be to rehearse each step with Suzy. Look right, then left, check the light, and glance around the corner. In the meantime, Suzy should not be allowed to cross any street unsupervised until she proves she knows how to be careful.

“I spank my child knows what it feels like.” Four-year-old Paul was placing the final block on his castle when his baby sister knocked it over. Paul was furious at her for ruining his creation, so he hit her. Their mother, Joan, who had witnessed the scene, was equally furious at the way he had lashed out. As she spanked Paul she said, “This will teach you not to hit your little sister! Now you know how much it hurts!”

“Wrecked my castle!” Paul yelled. “You always take her side. I hate you!”

It’s unlikely that Paul felt apologetic or chastened, determined to try harder to get along with his sister next time. And by spanking Paul, Joan was modeling the very behavior she was trying to prevent, sending the message that hitting is an acceptable way to solve problems, that it’s all right for a big person to strike a smaller one.

A more effective solution would be a firmly stated “Hitting is not allowed in this house. Tell your sister you’re sorry.” And Joan might suggest that next time she will help him set up a work area that is out of his sister’s reach. The key to this approach is consistency. If you establish a nonnegotiable rule of no hitting in your family—and abide by it yourself—your children are less likely to use hitting as a way to settle their disputes.

“I was spanked, and I turned out okay.” I hear this a lot. But if you think back to your reaction as a child when your mom or dad hit you, I doubt you were grateful that they cared enough to teach you a lesson. More likely, you were too busy feeling resentful, humiliated, and helpless. Frankly, on the few occasions my mother or father spanked me when I was young, the only lesson I learned was that I should try harder not to get caught. Many of us remember our parents’ saying when they spanked us, “This hurts more than it hurts you.” We didn’t really understand what they meant by that, but it didn’t ring true since we were the ones who were feeling the pain.

Let’s face it, spanking hurts. Is that what we want? Think about what your child feels when you spank or slap him, and ask yourself, “Have I really taught him something of value?”

Nancy Samalin is a contributing editor of Parents as well as the coauthor, with Catherine Whitney, of Love & Anger: The Parental Dilemma (Penguin).
I. Does the thesis statement include the audience (writer of the original essay), his or her claim, and your classmate’s refutation or counter-argument? Label them above the thesis on the essay.

II. Does the introduction make the rebuttal clear? Is it clear from the introduction that this is a rebuttal essay? Comment in the margins of the essay.

III. Look for areas that are weak, illogical, or need more support. Provide comments on the essay.
   A. Does your classmate explain why the author of the essay holds his specific stance?
   B. Does your classmate explain why his or her stance is better? Does your classmate sufficiently explain how his or her solution will actually solve the problem?
   C. If your classmate does provide specific examples, does he or she use adequate explanation of those examples to show how they connect to his or her claims throughout the essay?
   D. Does anything your classmate say lack enough supporting evidence to convince the author of the article he or she is rebutting?

IV. What is the best part of the paper? Why?

V. What suggestions do you have for your classmate to make the rebuttal argument more effective?
ORGANIZATION CHECKERS

I. Check the outline against the essay. Is the Roman numeral I consistent with the first body paragraph in the essay? Continue this process through the sub-points and the rest of the outline. Write in the margin of the essay if the author does not follow the outline.

II. Turn to the essay text. On the thesis, write number 1 over the first main point you expect to see discussed in the paper, number 2 over the second main point you expect to see, and number 3 over the third main point you expect to see.

III. Looking at the numbers you just wrote on the thesis statement, read the controlling sentence of the corresponding main body paragraphs.
   A. Do they match your labeled numbers? Make a note on the paper if the person needs to change something.
   B. Does each controlling sentence reference the writer of the original essay, his or her claim, and your classmate’s refutation or counterargument? Each controlling sentence should be arguable and function like a mini-thesis statement.

IV. Read each paragraph. Is the paragraph unified?
   A. Does the paragraph keep to the main point mentioned in the controlling sentence?
   B. Does it begin to make a different point or lose track of the argument point altogether?
   C. Is there a concluding sentence present? Does it wrap-up the discussion by referring to elements in the controlling sentence elements?
   D. Is there a hook or a lead-in sentence at the end of the paragraph? Make a note for the author to remove this sentence and create a concluding sentence.

V. Transition words or phrases (such as “however,” in addition to,” or “also) provide a link between sentences and ideas.
   A. Highlight any transition words you find and write a note explaining if they are effective or not.
   B. Put a star and a note in any location where a transition is needed. Look at controlling sentences and inside paragraphs where links are needed. Some suggestions include: furthermore, in addition, another example, on the other hand, contrary to, etc.
SOURCE MATERIAL CHECKERS

I. Draw boxes around each use of source information within the paper; include the signal tag and ending citation.
   A. If there is no author or the source is a newspaper article, make note that the source cannot be used.
   B. Confirm that each one has both a signal tag and an ending citation. If something is missing, make a note.
   C. Confirm that each source within the paper is listed on the Works Cited page. Make notes where appropriate if information is missing.

II. Pick one of your classmate's sources.
   A. Find each instance of this source's use in the student's paper.
      1. Is the author's full name and some form of credibility included in the signal tag the first time the source is used?
      2. Does the author's last name (only) appear in either the signal tag or the ending citation (not both) for each successive use of this source? If not, make a note where appropriate.
   B. Check the first Direct Quote against the original source by reading the source paragraph from which it comes.
      1. Does the context of the original paragraph change the meaning of the quote your classmate used? If so, make a note in the margins of your classmate's essay.
      2. Does the student's use of this source make sense in this particular paragraph? Does the quote add something to your classmate's argument?
      3. Does the use of this source make sense? Does it add something to your classmate's argument?
      4. Is the quote copied exactly like the original? Are any omissions indicated with ellipses ... ? Are any additions or alterations indicated with brackets [ ]?
   C. Check the Sentence of Incorporation (SOI). Is it merely restating/summarizing the source material, or does it explain how the source supports your classmate's argument?
   D. Find the other time(s) your classmate uses this source in the paper, and follow the appropriate steps from instructions B & C.

III. Repeat the above steps for the other sources. When finished, leave a note for your classmate explaining what (s)he is doing well with source integration and how (s)he can improve.
Sentence & Format Checkers

**Sentence Errors:**
Skim through the essay looking for the following:
I. Draw a box around any contractions (it’s, you’re, can’t, won’t, etc.) If you find them outside of a quotation, they should be removed from the essay.
II. Draw a box around any of the following words. If you find them outside of a quotation, they should be removed: [I me mine we our us your There are/were]
III. Identify any pronoun-antecedent disagreements you can find. In order to do so, circle the following words if you find them – they may or may not need to be corrected:
[He/She They Their One His/her It is]
Then Draw an arrow to the noun being referenced by those words you just circled. Do they match (single with single, plural with plural)? Make a note in the margin if the author needs to change something.
IV. Label any sentence fragments you find.
V. Label any run-ons that you find.
VI. Label any comma splices you find.
VII. Write down questions beside any awkward sentences you discover.

**Format Errors:**
I. Check spacing:
   A. Margins ~1 inch. What about the bottom margin? Is it greater than 1 inch? Tell your author to change his or her bottom margin to .9, which will take care of the problem.
   B. Are there extra spaces between paragraphs? Or between heading elements? Mark this in the margins.
II. Check heading and page numbers:
   A. The heading (student author’s name, GSA name, Course, and date) goes on two pages: the first page of the outline, and the first page of the essay text. It does NOT go on the works cited page.
   B. The page numbers begin on the first page of the outline (student author’s last name and the page’s number) and continue throughout the essay. The works cited page will have the last number on it.
III. Outline format:
   A. A creative title?
   B. Thesis should be directly under the title.
   C. Roman numerals each have sub-points? If not, make a note in the margin.
   D. If there is an A, then there must be a B. If there is a 1, then there must be a 2.
   E. Length? For this essay, the outline should be at least 1 ½ pages in length. If it is not, make a note.
IV. Is the essay long enough? It should be 3 full pages in length and no more than 3.5 (fold the last page in half).
V. Works Cited page:
   A. Works are in alphabetical order by the author’s last name?
   B. Hanging indent?
What is the Point of Forgiveness?

Thesis: Bob Brody claims that holding a grudge is just as satisfying as forgiveness, this is flawed because he fails to acknowledge that grudges do not allow for healthy trust and optimism in relationships, grudges do not show compassion, and grudges do not reflect a righteous life.

I. Brody writes that he believes in the healing power of grudges when exercised in relationships, but grudges can cause trust issues and a pessimistic environments when they are allowed to influence relationships.

   A. Brody claims that many times in relationships feelings get hurt, whether it is on purpose or an accident does not usually matter.

   B. When grudges are nursed, they can affect other areas of life too.

   C. Optimisms allows people to feel safer in their relationships, and this will make a way of positive conversations to take place.

II. Brody claims that holding grudges shows standards, but grudges show a lack of compassion in a relationship.

   A. Brody claims that in many life situations, grudges can feel justified in the moment.

   B. When Brody fails to express is that grudges and unforgiveness rarely are done out of anything more than spite.

   C. Showing compassion is impossible when hurt feelings are what drive how

***Additional content has been deleted***
What is the Point of Forgiveness?

People have always questioned the point of forgiveness in their lives. Many times it is easier not to forgive or passively avoid a situation rather than sit and decide how to resolve a problem and forgive. Many times, forgiveness does not show itself in the ways originally intended. Rarely a soulful apology that follows an expressive and well thought out conversation, and usually there is no immediate beneficial feeling from the act of forgiving a transgressor. Bob Brody claims that holding a grudge is just as satisfying as forgiveness, but this is flawed because he fails to acknowledge that grudges do not allow for healthy trust and optimism in relationships, do not show compassion, and do not reflect a righteous life.

Brody writes that he believes in the healing power of grudges when exercised in relationships, but grudges can cause trust issues and a pessimistic environments when they are allowed to influence relationships. Many times in a relationship feelings get hurt. Whether on purpose or an accident does not usually matter. A hurt is a hurt. Bob Brody writes in his article that “[h]e has discovered that nothing feels quite as satisfying as a grudge well nursed” (64). When grudges are nursed, they can affect other areas of life too. They can put stress on relationships with other people. There is a constant part of a hurt mind that looks for other situations that could hurt, and a person will close off as soon as he or she feels that something might be damaging in a relationship. This is a very pessimistic view of life and the people that live their lives intertwined with ours. Everett Worthington Jr. and Nathaniel G. Wade writers of The Psychology of Unforgiveness and Forgiveness claim that, “The tendency to view life
optimistically will assist a person to make less permanent damaging attributions of his or her offending partner. Optimisms will also assist the victim to view the relationship with positive expectancies” (407). Optimisms allows people to feel safer in their relationships, and this will make a way of positive conversations to take place. When you expect good out of people then offenses will start to look less like the end of the relationship and more like a means to express one’s self in a healthy and safe way. Instead of ending a relationship, a new piece of the relationship can grow. Unforgiveness does not only cause pessimism, but can also cause control issues.

Brody claims that holding grudges shows standards, but grudges show a lack of compassion in a relationship. Many times in life grudges can feel justified in the moment, Brody writes in his article, “A longstanding grudge suggests that we respect ourselves enough to reject bad behavior.” (65). What Brody fails to express is that grudges and unforgiveness rarely are done out of anything more than spite. More often grudges are a way of finalizing a feeling of being done wrong. There is no compassion in a relationship where grudges cause a feeling of self-righteousness and honor. In an article, written by Zenon Szablowinski He uses the example of a family struggling with the murder of their daughter: “Through a shift the placed the violent event firmly in the past not allowing it to control the present and the future.” (Self-Forgiveness and Forgiveness 679) Grudges, unlike forgiveness, do not allow for control to be relinquished. Instead, it allows for the negative feeling to take hold in all areas of relationships with people. Showing compassion is impossible when hurt feelings are what drive how interactions take place in a relationship. Shablowinski then claims, “Their forgiveness did not justify or disregard Amy’s violent death” (679-680). Forgiveness does not mean that transgressions are overlooked or made light of, on the contrary, if a wrong is done toward someone, it should be brought to

***Additional content has been deleted***
Work Cited


Is It Just Me?

To Forgive Is Good
But sometimes I want to stay mad

S
ome years ago, a barrage of thumping, galloping noises routinely issued from the apartment upstairs as if baby elephants were competing in 50-yard dashes. I went up one day to politely inquire. “No, nobody’s making any noise here,” the husband and wife both insisted. “It must be coming from elsewhere in the building.” Two children about five years old, each holding soccer balls, stood right beside their parents. “Could the thumping be your kids running around, perhaps playing soccer?” I asked. “Oh, no, we never let the kids play in the house.” For months, the pattern continued: the thumping and galloping above, our delicate check-in, the denial. It got so that every time I saw the couple, I glared without a word of greeting. When they moved out of the building, the thumping stopped.

I suppose I could have forgiven my neighbors this infraction and spared them the glare. After all, forgiveness is in, a trend spawning bestselling books, foundations, and research institutes. The notion has gone well beyond spiritual leaders advising that forgiveness is good for the soul and that hard feelings will turn us bitter and hostile. Now the medical community cites studies showing that forgiveness can prevent heart attacks, lower blood pressure, and even ease depression.

I may be outnumbered, but I still believe in the healing power of the grudge. I’ve deployed grudges with an equal-opportunity sense of fairness—against teachers and classmates, bosses and colleagues, family and friends. I’ve chosen to stop speaking to certain people permanently and occasionally even spoken ill of them—but more with incredulity than a sense of revenge. I’m neither proud nor ashamed. But I’ve discovered that nothing feels quite as satisfying as a grudge well nursed.

I had a boss who took a dislike to me from my first day on the job, even though she’d hired me. There were no complaints about my performance, but I later learned she’d lied to coworkers about me. Without explanation, she laid me off after only ten weeks, just before Thanksgiving. I had a family to support. Was I to forgive her? Should I now? Give me one good reason. My grudge against her balanced out that injustice, somehow righted the universe. It has kept me warm on many a cold night.

Is it just me? Under the new mandate of blanket absolution, should I forgive the cousin who invited us to dinner only to make an Amway pitch? Or the friend who sent me a public relations client and then harassed me for months for a 10 percent finder’s fee?

I’m not against forgiveness per se; I have forgiven people for rudeness as well as for deep misunderstandings and have done so without holding on to hard feelings. What I deplore is the propaganda about forgiveness. No longer an option, forgiveness is an edict. Forgiving so democratically cheapens the very act. A long-standing grudge suggests that we hold certain standards, that we respect ourselves enough to reject bad behavior. Failure to forgive can be just as righteous, just as honorable, as forgiveness itself.

When someone apologizes, however, with sincerity, not calculation, it can make a difference. I had a close friend in high school who ditched me after college and has avoided me for all the decades since. At our 15th high school reunion, I had the chance to ask him why. He said that I had always made him feel inferior, as if he gave offense. And he had a point: I’d made fun of him—I’d thought good-naturedly—until he withdrew. Face-to-face at our reunion, I apologized. He declined. I know how it feels to go unforgiven. And guess what? It feels deserved.
